DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 464 339 CS 510 945

AUTHOR Gorelick, Risa P.
TITLE Service-Learning's Flaw: What's Community Got To Do With It?
PUB DATE 2002-03-21
NOTE 26p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Conference on College Composition and Communication (53rd, Chicago, IL, March 20-23, 2002).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research (143) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Case Studies; College Freshmen; Concept Formation; *Females; Higher Education; Portfolios (Background Materials); *Service Learning; *Writing Instruction; Writing Research
IDENTIFIERS Model Characteristics; Writing Contexts

ABSTRACT

"Writing the Community: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Composition" (1997, Adler-Kassner, et. al.) begins with calling the inclusion of service-learning curricula into college-level composition a "microrevolution" rather than a trend. However, a review of the service-learning composition literature illustrates that the discussion of community has been mostly absent from this "microrevolution." The central issue examined in this study is that no one can agree what is meant by the term community in service-learning writing endeavors. To address the issue, the research employs a case study of nine first-year college women and their professor involved in what Thomas Deans considers a "writing 'about' the community" service-learning composition course at a private east coast liberal arts college. Students are analyzed through their course portfolios and interviews to see how they conceptualize community in their service-learning site placements. Their professor's profile provides an understanding of how she conceives the term "community" in her classroom as an example of how other faculty can incorporate discussions of community into their service-learning courses. This paper provides a sketch of Parker Palmer's community models (marketing, civic, and therapeutic) by examining three of the original nine students in the study through the writing in their course portfolios. The paper concludes that just as compositionists have come to see writing as a process, those who employ service-learning in their writing courses will also see a process to how students negotiate through the models of community. (NKA)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 464 339

"Service-Learning's Flaw: What's Community Got to Do with It?"

CCCC 2002

Risa P. Gorelick, Ph.D.

Francis Marion University

E-mail: rgorelick@fmarion.edu

Or

risa1804@aol.com

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

R P Gorelick

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

CS 510 945

Writing the Community: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Composition begins with calling the inclusion of service-learning curricula into college-level composition a "microrevolution" rather than a trend (Adler-Kassner, Crooks, and Watters 1). A review of the service-learning composition literature, however, illustrates that the discussion of community has been predominately absent from this "microrevolution." The central issue examined in my study is that no one can agree what is meant by the term community in service-learning writing endeavors. To better address this issue, my research employs a case study of nine first-year college women and their professor involved in what Thomas Deans considers a "writing *about* the community" service-learning composition course at a private east coast liberal arts college. Students are analyzed through their course portfolios and interviews to see how they conceptualize community in their service-learning site placements. Their professor's profile provides an understanding of how she conceives the term "community" in her classroom as an example of how other faculty can incorporate discussions of community into their service-learning courses.

Community's place in the service-learning discussion has been hampered because, at the present time, no one has applied any theories of community to this discipline. This study begins to address this deficiency by employing Parker J. Palmer's three models of community (marketing, civic, and therapeutic) which appear in his book, *The Courage to Teach: Exploring the Inner Landscape of a Teacher's Life*. Palmer's models allow connections between students and their service sites to be examined in terms of community relationships that formed during semester long service-learning projects. By exploring the various relationships between students and the clients at the agencies under Palmer's models using an "ethic of care" described by Carol Gilligan, Nel Noddings, Mary Field

Belenky *et al.* and other feminist scholars, a case can be made for the importance of including pedagogical changes into service-learning composition courses which enhance community connections and highlight how such courses contribute to a "microrevolution" rather than a trend in composition studies. This paper provides a sketch of Palmer's community models by examining three of the original nine students in the study through the writing in their course portfolios.

Applying Palmer's Models of Community

Palmer offers three models of community: marketing, civic and therapeutic. Although Palmer's models were not originally intended for a service-learning setting, the characteristics of his models allow faculty to chart the growth of individual students by using the models as a heuristic to evaluate students' experiences at their service sites. It is important to note, however, that not all students will fit neatly into one of Palmer's community models based on the service s/he does at the site. Some individuals may move back and forth between multiple models of community or progress from one model to another.

MARKETING MODEL OF COMMUNITY

"The marketing model of community is blitzing American education today under the flag of Total Quality Management [TQM]," a business model first made popular by the Japanese and brought to corporate America in the early 1990s, states Palmer (93). The main characteristic of such a model is to provide accountability between educators and their clients (the students) with the goal of "fixing" a problem, generally by empowering those with little authority to attempt to fix the problem. Those in this case study attained authority, generally from the agencies' staff members, to assist clients. Palmer believes this

model does not serve the education system well, as one does not necessarily have to understand the problem in order to fix it.

As American businesses did not find TQM easily applied to employees, Palmer does not believe this model is the best idea for educational institutions. Unlike corporate America, few educators see students as "customers" and an education as a "product" (Palmer 93). When applied to an educational setting, Palmer finds, "the norms of the marketing model are straightforward: educational institutions must improve their product by strengthening relations with customers and becoming more accountable to them" (93). While not the best model of community, the marketing model fares somewhat better in a service-learning than an educational setting where the customers generally are the clients who are being served. Students who work with clients and treat them with respect acquire accountability as they attempt to fix problems experienced by the clients. Those students who come into their service-learning project wanting to make a difference–usually through fixing a problem they see either in a client's individual life or one at the agency–serve in a marketing model of community.

Julie

A prolific writer named Julie experienced the marketing model of community in the service she did for her English course. She decided to tutor at an adult literacy program called English Speakers of Other Languages [ESOL]. Those involved ESOL were women who were "here to learn English while their husbands worked or studied" at the research university; Julie wished to "fix" the literacy and linguistic barriers that kept these women from fully functioning in their new city. Unlike other students in her class, Julie chose to combine her English project with a sociology course that required that she learn about other

cultures. "I believe the women had a different agenda. These women were in the group not just to help me but to learn about the English language and the American society." Through participation in the ESOL program, the women formed a community where they could discuss and question their larger area around them: the university, the city, the state, the United States, and the world. Julie's role was that of facilitator of the group where she assisted the women with reading, writing, and speaking in English. As a facilitator, Julie "learned about what other cultures think of the United States and helped to teach what the United States believes about some of these cultures." Unlike some of her other classmates, though, her journal did not share many narratives from the women's lives, but, instead focused primarily on the cultural differences experienced by these women.

She entered the room her first day filled with stereotypes. Her original thought was that most of these women were not as educated as their graduate student and professor husbands. "I do have to admit that I went into this position thinking that these women probably wouldn't hold professional positions because of the way that they came to America. However, every single one of them proved me wrong." Many of the women held professional careers ranging from dentists to engineers.

Although Julie acted as a facilitator, she empowered the women to share their stories to practice their English skills. She recorded,

> this discussion later turned into how each woman felt about leaving her own country. Most of the women expressed being upset about having to leave, but knew that they were obligated to accompany their husbands to America. Other women felt excited about seeing America. In general, however, there was a slight resentment felt among these women for having to give up their

jobs.

Julie recognized that there was "one common issue among every one of the women who have been in the program. Each one has been struggling to come out of her silence." While the majority of the women in the ESOL community were educated and had professional careers in their home countries, Julie observed, "all of the women like to discuss topics that affect the world," but some topics "seem to be off limits. Sometimes my leading questions into these 'forbidden topics' would get an answer of silence." Of course, all people choose to be silent on particular topics, yet Julie found the mind-set of non-American women in this group oppressed by patriarchy and wished she could facilitate a way for these women to break out of their silence which she observed in her meetings with them. Julie declared, "I know that it is not their fault. Most women have come from countries that have a patriarchal culture [. . .] and are known to silence their women. A woman is lucky to leave these countries with a timid voice." These women wanted to learn to communicate with those both inside the ESOL community but also with other communities–their husbands' colleagues, religious organizations, neighbors, clerks in the grocery stores, and whomever else they come into contact with on their day-to-day adventures. Julie believed, "these women are the lucky women. They do have timid voices, and although I have encouraged discussion throughout the semester, many have been reluctant to share their experiences because they do not want to be 'wrong,'" even though Julie informed them "there is no right or wrong" answer in their ESOL community. While Julie tried repeatedly to empower women to speak on any and all subjects, however, she found herself frustrated as she watched them unable to seize their empowerment. One reason for the women's silence may be that they did not wish to share with Julie, as she was not a member of the ESOL

community in the same way that these women were. Towards the end of the semester, however, as the women became more comfortable in this setting, Julie noticed, "slowly they are overcoming their silence and exploring their own inner selves. I hope each of them takes her voice back to her own country and uses it as a powerful tool to better her life."

Julie believed that much more can be accomplished when communities are connected together (for example, beginning to liberate women who were oppressed by empowering women to speak). This concept is one of the most prevalent underlying theories behind the service-learning movement where students learn to cross–and connect–the boundaries of communities through their service work. Yet, based on her experience with ESOL, Julie could not abolish patriarchy even though she attempted to empower the women in the program. While Julie's role in this community was that of a facilitator rather than as a full-fledged member, based on her U.S. citizenship, she was able to connect to the women in the community and, in the end, they were able to learn from each other. However, since her portfolio contained few narratives of the individual women's lives, it is difficult to observe whether or not Julie ever moved beyond Palmer's understanding of a marketing community, as these women were here to strengthen their English skills to enable them to get along better in the United States. Julie attempted to "fix" the literacy problems these international women experienced. Julie began to assist these women without having much of an understanding of them, as she admits early in her portfolio that she entered her service site filled with stereotypes of these women. She learns from working with these women to abandon some of the stereotypes as she gets to know them, but her portfolio did not show any intimate connection between Julie and the ESOL women. One of the reasons the women may not have responded well to Julie's request to break their silence is that Julie

did not fully understand or comprehend the reasons behind the women's silence. Without an understanding of the issues at hand, Julie cannot advance beyond Palmer's marketing model of community, even though Julie was able to assist the women with their English reading, speaking and writing skills.

CIVIC MODEL OF COMMUNITY

"When we are not dependent on each other," Palmer believes, "community cannot exist" (139). While dependence on each other is central to all of Palmer's models of community, it is especially important in the civic model where individuals must cooperate with each other for the good of the community. Many service agencies operate under this cooperative concept. Students involved in service-learning who reach this level of community actively participate with those at their placement. Active participation, under a civic model of community, focuses on doing more than just empowering clients to help themselves. Instead, students who actively participate at their agency get involved with the goal of making the world a better place through their service. Students who enter this model of community are not afraid to get their hands dirty through their service work. Their goal is to do more than just fix the problem of one or more of the clients. Students who find themselves in the civic model may not necessarily connect to individuals on an intimate level but, instead, try to find the reason behind the problems before attempting to fix the problem. By understanding the problem at hand, those in a civic community are equipped with the tools to fix the problem more than those at the marketing model of community, since the marketing model does not necessarily understand the reason(s) behind the problems at hand.

Sara

The homeless community was one that needed the warmth of volunteers. In the cold winter months, the urban area near Sara's college opened a homeless shelter where Sara completed her service; funding was insufficient to keep the shelter open during the warmer weather–an issue which Sara had difficulty accepting. During the warmer months that occurred towards the end of her semester project, the shelter closed and those who sought assistance there were once again turned back to the mean city streets. "Many of these people are in the process of getting jobs and getting their lives back in order. What happens when they are once again turned into the streets? How does one proceed to get one's life back without a support system?" she asked in her journal.

The fact that she was bothered by not knowing where the clients went once the shelter closed put Sara in Palmer's civic community where she wished she could solve her clients' problems and not have them in the homeless state they were in when she first met them. After her last visit to the shelter, she wrote,

> The shelter is closing next week. This is it! I have mixed emotions. Part of me is sad and worried that the people I've met will not be safe when they are gone from here. The other half of me is somewhat relieved because this was really not easy work. It makes me very appreciative of volunteers who give their lives up to do service work.

Sara understood that it took many people to help the homeless situation, and she was wise to include other volunteers in her understanding of the shelter. But even with volunteers who were there to help those less fortunate, Sara witnessed unfair treatment of the clients which upset her during her service and even a year later. Some of the clients, she learned, cannot be helped for more than a night at a time. The shelter is not a long-term solution to

homelessness but only a temporary one. She recorded in her journal:

> It is hard to see the injustices up close. These people [homeless clients] are so intelligent and eager to get back their lives (most of them). Of course, there are the ones who have become disheartened. Their struggles are too tough to bear. A woman I spoke with today is one of the ones who have given up. She has very low (if any) self-esteem and the light in many people's eyes seems to have been extinguished in hers. I kept wanting to shout out that everything would work out in the end, but something held me back. I wasn't quite sure if everything would work out in her case. She has no family, she dropped out of high school and became addicted to coke by the age of seventeen. She has been in and out of rehabs and nothing has worked. I will remember her always because of the look in her brown eyes [. . .] emptiness.

That empty feeling permeated her writing about the shelter where she related experiences she had with the homeless she met.

In her first journal, Sara described her first day as a "slow" one, so she was asked to go "downstairs and 'hang out' with the men." Sara journaled,

> I was a little scared because I didn't know what to do or who to talk to but I was immediately called over by a short, heavy-set black man. I asked his name and he said he couldn't tell me because he was wanted in ten states for murder! This was definitely a surprising statement that I had no idea how to deal with. So, I ignored it and preceded [*sic*] to have a long talk with this man

> [. . .] about religion, being black, money and many other things.

Her sheltered life–which gave her ample opportunities including attending the private liberal arts college–was vastly different from life in the shelter. She was not sure what to expect, but she really did not envision having someone admit that he was wanted for murder. However, she claimed, "basically, I wasn't even sure if he was serious–he didn't seem completely connected with reality." Sara went to the shelter with another volunteer who said,

> "you're going to hear a lot of crazy things from these guys and just let it go over your head and just give them a little respite from their daily lives." So when he [the man who claimed he was wanted for murder] said that, he could be serious and he could have not been. Initially I was like, "Oh, God," but I remembered what she [the volunteer] had said and just listened to him.

This experience would have made it easy for Sara to "other"–or objectify–this man whom she thought was probably mentally ill rather than wanted for murder in ten states, yet despite their differences, she tried to treat him with respect.

The ideas of civic model community also permeated Sara's writing. Through her work at the shelter, Sara saw problems with separating individuals from community, as she really did not get to know clients at the homeless shelter as individuals, although she does share stories of some of the encounters she had with some of the residents she met at the shelter. She believed residents needed more interaction to make them feel like more of a community while they were at the shelter. In her second journal entry, Sara wrote, "I noticed many of the residents kept somewhat to themselves. There was not much talking between them. It made me want to get them all together and introduce each resident, so

they could become a group or community instead of individuals [. . .] kind of like a group therapy of sorts." Sara believed that these individuals needed some sort of a civic community to which they belong–a community which would understand the reasons why these people were homeless in the first place. Instead, the clients struggled to obtain any sense of community (most of those whom Sara reported on failed to obtain *any* sense of community) while Sara was able to work to the civic model of community through her work during her time at the homeless shelter.

THERAPEUTIC MODEL OF COMMUNITY

The therapeutic model of community focuses on the intimacy achieved between people in a social setting which relieves the "pain of disconnection" (Palmer 90). Those who reach the therapeutic level of community go beyond interaction and move towards an ethic of care outlined in feminist theory. For students to reach this level of community, they must go beyond their basic duties and intimately connect to those whom they meet. Likewise, to reach this level, students must invest their time and energy in the agency's cause. Students in this case study who reached this level bonded with the clients at the agencies. Narratives were recorded in their portfolios which provide some insights into each student's experience with the clients at the agencies.

Holly

Holly, a gifted song writer, decided to do her service-learning component at a residential home for people with AIDS which housed four to five residents during the semester in this study. In her first journal, she described the homey atmosphere of the kitchen where she sat at a dinner table with the others. "There was a total of five volunteers at the dinner table, and only three residents, so at first, I wasn't sure who lived here and who

was volunteering." This uncertainty of who was who made her "very nervous" at first, but she overcame this feeling. However, the issue of who belonged in this community because of an illness and who belonged in this community because they hoped to help out cannot be ignored. She mentioned volunteers separately from those who lived in this house. She noticed "on a small table, lay several volunteer log-in books" and noted the pages "were filled with many different names and dated back a few years to the present. It was interesting to stand there and think about how many others had volunteered there in the past." This log-in book traced members of the outside community who had contributed to this agency. The question remained, though, if these former volunteers were members of this community, at least during the time in which they volunteered, or if once volunteers finished their service they ceased to remain a part of the community.

Once Holly figured out who was who, she described those who were present at the dinner in detail:

> We sat around a table of fried chicken and fruit punch. Frank, in his authentic Guatemalan waistcoat, was seated to my right and Mr. Shavers quietly nibbled on his food at the other end of the table. Frank and a student from [another] college discussed the different strains of meningitis and how there had been a scare in the area a few years ago. Sharon bustled noisily through the dining room on her way to the kitchen, her breathing loud and unsteady. The room was full of voices, of stories.

On the very first night of her service experience, Holly began to hear some of the stories, which gave her access to the group home community of both the residents, volunteers, and staff members.

When Holly gained her bearings, she had a powerful exchange with a resident named Martel, which she shared in a narrative.[7] When she began working with Martel, she learned that AIDS had affected his eyesight, and he was blind at the time Holly met him.

> Martel, another resident, popped his head in the kitchen and asked for a spoon. I sat down in the dining room with him later as he ate his dinner and he asked me if I smoked. I told him that I didn't and he smiled and said that's good, did you ever smoke? I answered his question and he told me that he didn't used to smoke, that he started when he arrived at the [house]. I was about to tell him that he should quit because smoking is bad for one's health, but I caught myself* (as I remembered that this man has AIDS). I realized how different our lives are. I have my life ahead of me, whereas he is uncertain of how much longer he will be around.

On the bottom of her hand-written journal page, she made another asterisk and wrote, "not sure if it was appropriate." Her uncertainty of the appropriateness of remembering this man was dying of AIDS, of course, was natural. Not many first-year students have had much contact with people who have terminal diseases outside of family members. At the time she made this comment, she was "not sure if it was appropriate" because she had not established an intimate connection with Martel, as it was their first meeting.

On her next visit, Holly continued her conversation with Martel and recorded it, in a song-like format, in her journal:

> "I have a wife, a daughter, and a son. Good looking boy. Da de de dum la da be la doo humm [. . .]" His smile drops as if all the weight in the world were attached to the corners of his mouth. His eyes widened and his head begins

> to nod back and forth. "Do you smoke?" he asks for the fiftieth time. "No," I reply. Martel likes to sing; he likes to smoke. Martel likes to drink cool iced tea on warm spring days when the tulip breeze washes through the house. I start to hum a tune, "what song is that?" he asks. "Oh, I don't know. I'm just hummin' again." A chuckle, very loud, and then the smile is gone again and the tear returns to his eyes. "What is he thinking about," I often wonder? "Da de de dum la da de ba da," he says, "Amen [. . .] amen."

Here Holly showed how she wanted to understand Martel–to get into his head and make sense of what he was feeling. She desired to gain his trust and friendship–to form an intimate bond required in a therapeutic community. In an end-of-the-semester in-class writing, she answered the question, "Did you make a difference?" in her service project by writing:

> Yes, I think so, in small ways, maybe I was the reason that someone smiled or laughed. I shared my songs with them, and I think that when you show anyone a little part of yourself, they digest it, like it, dislike it [. . .] you have an effect on them in some way or another.

Through her music, Holly penetrated the protective shell surrounding residents like Martel to join the community.

On one of her last visits to the group home during her semester of service, frightening realizations hit Holly hard.

> I arrived at the house just as a yellow taxi slowly pulled away from the curb. Frank was walking stiffly towards the house. He ascended the stairs slowly and went into the door. After entering the house, I looked around and saw

> Mr. Shavers and Martel sitting at the dining room table. They told us that Frank had just come home from the hospital. They thought that he had the flu and were quite surprised to see him back [. . .]. As he turned around and looked into my eyes last week, it hit me: Frank is dying. Of course, I know that already, but it was something that I thought about before I knew him well. I realize at this point that it is likely that I'm going to lose Frank, perhaps I should not be so quick to state that, but I thought that was what I saw in his eyes. The words HIV and AIDS have never been uttered in the house while I've been there, and I'm terrified to even think about discussing the virus with any of the residents. I think that this is OK, though.

Most communities have rules; Holly recognized that discussing the virus that brought them together was something that no one cared to do. She respected the reason, even if she did not completely understand it. Holly ended her journal by writing, "I intend to volunteer regularly at the house next semester. I just really hope that everybody is still there next year. I'm not sure if that's too much to ask." Her question of uncertainty as to who will remain in the community because of the possibility of the death of the residents from their illness is a powerful–and frightening–one for Holly. Since Holly formed bonds with Martel, Frank, and other residents in the group home through her service, she achieved the level of intimacy required for Palmer's therapeutic model of community. By continuing to volunteer at the group home after her course requirement had ended, she deepened her commitment and bond to those at the agency and further solidified her role in this therapeutic community.

Conclusion

In the past century, the term "community" has evolved and changed. Today, communities are no longer solely defined by geographical, ethnic, and social boundaries. The students who participated in this study show how models of community are complicated based on the relationships formed by service-learning connections. Such complications often allow students to move between the models of community as their level of commitment and involvement with their clients at their site changes and grows. Palmer's models of community can be used as a gauge to measure where students are in terms of community as they progress through and complete their service-learning work. His models provide a way for service-learning composition courses to begin discussing how communities are defined and how communities affect students' service-learning work.

Students' service-learning work do not always neatly fit into one of Palmer's models. Instead, they may move between Palmer's community models as the course progresses and as they become more (or less) involved at their service site. Sometimes students will waver back and forth between two models of community. Occasionally, students' writing shows movement among all three models of community as the students navigate their way through the agency they are serving. For example, a student may begin her service-learning work at the marketing model by wanting to "fix" the problem of one individual's homelessness. This task, however, requires more than just finding the client a home. In the civic model, the student must become acquainted with the client to first see if the client wants to have a permanent home. If so, the student needs to help the client find a way to pay for the rent and utilities and perhaps help the client find adequate daycare for the client's children. As the student continues to work with the client, the two may form a bond which would put the student in the therapeutic model of community as they have enhanced

their relationship enough to become intimate with each other. Just as compositionists have come to see writing as a process, those who employ service-learning in their writing courses will also see a process to how students negotiate through the models of community. Neither the writing nor community processes tend to follow a linear path, which makes both more difficult, but not impossible, to chart through Palmer's models of community.

Examining and understanding community allows the inherent flaw of service-learning to begin to be eradicated in composition courses that employ this pedagogical tool. If community continues to be ignored in such venues, the "microrevolution" of service-learning may turn into a composition trend that is quickly replaced by the next one. Service-learning writing projects have proven to teach such valuable lessons; we should not continue to ignore community because it is a cumbersome task. If we do ignore community in service-learning writing courses, we risk losing an important partner in our composition programs.

Palmer's Models of Community

While Palmer's models allow faculty to facilitate discussions of community in a service-learning course, this study makes no claim that Palmer's models of community are the best or only way in which to examine the idea of community in service-learning composition courses. These models, however, provide a solid grounding in the concept of community and are easily applied to such courses. Therefore, in order to begin incorporating ideas of community and have a lens in which to view the ideas of community in such courses, Palmer's models come highly recommended to compositionists who employ service-learning in their courses. When applying each of Palmer's community models to service-learning composition courses, as this case study has shown, some conclusions can be drawn:

- **Marketing Model:** This model is the basic level of community. It attempts to empower both the student and the client with whom s/he works by having the student attempt to "fix" the client's problems. However, the biggest flaw to this model is that often the student does not have a solid enough understanding of the client and/or the problem in order to correct it. When applied to a service-learning composition course, this level of community should be carefully monitored to ensure that students have a sufficient understanding of the issues at hand prior to empowering the student to attempt to "fix" any problems. For instance, a student tutoring a child at a learning center should know enough about the child to assess why the child is having difficulties reading. The student should know if English is spoken at the child's home and if the child's parents/guardians are literate. If the child is dyslexic or has other learning disabilities, the student should be made aware of them so that the student, with the assistance of a supervisor at the tutoring center, can best determine how to tutor the child and improve the child's reading level.

- **Civic Model:** This model is a good one for professors to set as a goal for the whole service-learning class to achieve, realizing that some students will not get to this level and some may go beyond it. While students often do not form intimate connections with clients and staff at their agency under this model, the civic model of community allows students to make substantial connections between the agency, clients, and course materials. For example, if students are given readings on the welfare system and then serve at a site where many of the clients are on welfare, the students can see how the laws impact individuals with whom they have come into contact. Students bring what they observe back to their classroom via writing assignments and/or class discussion and gain a better understanding of the course readings by further exploring and discussing the issue of welfare. Under the civic model, students can determine who matters and who is marginalized and attempt to give a voice to those who are marginalized through sharing the stories of these individuals in students' writing assignments. As students begin to understand the complexities of the welfare system, the civic model encourages students to move

towards participating in social action for the betterment of the agency and the "communities" that surround it by applying what Linda Flower calls "problem solving strategies" which aim, through social action, to address the issue at hand (in this example, welfare reform) at the service-site level and perhaps beyond.

- **Therapeutic Model:** This model is the ideal one where intimate connections between the student-client and/or student-agency occurs. However, this model takes more time to develop than the other two. Generally, students cannot achieve this level of community at their service-learning site until extensive work with the agency and/or clients has occurred. For many students, it may take more than one semester to achieve this level of community; however, the therapeutic model of community may be seen during the course of the semester from those who have had previous ties to the agencies and/or clients before the service-learning course began. This level of community is more likely to occur after the service-learning requirement is completed if the student chooses to continue with his/her contacts at the agency as a volunteer and/or the student continues to see client(s) outside of the agency after the initial service-learning course (e.g. continuing to mentor an at-risk youth after doing service-learning work at a tutoring facility but not continuing as a tutor at the facility).

Works Cited

Adler-Kassner, Linda, *et al.*, eds. *Writing the Community: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Composition.* Washington, DC: AAHE/NCTE, 1997.

Belenky, Mary Field, *et al. Women's Ways of Knowing: The Development o Self, Voice, and Mind.* New York: Basic Books, 1986.

Deans, Thomas. *Writing Partnerships: Service-Learning in Composition.* Urbana, IL: NCTE, 2000.

Gilligan, Carol. *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development.* Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1982.

Gorelick, Risa P. *The Idea of Community: Service-Learning Connections to the Writing Classroom.* Diss. U of Louisiana at Lafayette, 2001. Ann Arbor: UMI, 2001. 3029834

Noddings, Nel. *Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics and Moral Education.* Berkeley: U of California P, 1984.

Palmer, Parker J. *The Courage to Teach: Exploring the Inner Landscape of a Teacher's Life.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1998.

Risa P. Gorelick, Ph.D., Francis Marion University E-mail: rgorelick@fmarion.edu or risa1804@aol.com

Palmer's Models of Community

While Palmer's models allow faculty to facilitate discussions of community in a service-learning course, this study makes no claim that Palmer's models of community are the best or only way in which to examine the idea of community in service-learning composition courses. These models, however, provide a solid grounding in the concept of community and are easily applied to such courses. Therefore, in order to begin incorporating ideas of community and have a lens in which to view the ideas of community in such courses, Palmer's models come highly recommended to compositionists who employ service-learning in their courses. When applying each of Palmer's community models to service-learning composition courses, as this case study has shown, some conclusions can be drawn:

- **Marketing Model:** This model, based on Total Quality Management, is the basic level of community. It attempts to empower both the student and the client with whom s/he works by having the student attempt to "fix" the client's problems. However, the biggest flaw to this model is that often the student does not have a solid enough understanding of the client and/or the problem in order to correct it. When applied to a service-learning composition course, this level of community should be carefully monitored to ensure that students have a sufficient understanding of the issues at hand prior to empowering the student to attempt to "fix" any problems. For instance, a student tutoring a child at a learning center should know enough about the child to assess why the child is having difficulties reading. The student should know if English is spoken at the child's home and if the child's parents/guardians are literate. If the child is dyslexic or has other learning disabilities, the student should be made aware of them so that the student, with the assistance of a supervisor at the tutoring center, can best determine how to tutor the child and improve the child's reading level. Without knowing such background information, the student is not likely to move beyond the Marketing Model of Community during her service at the agency.

- **Civic Model:** Under the civic model, "people who do not and cannot experience intimacy with each other nonetheless learn to share a common territory and common resources, to resolve mutual conflicts and mutual problems. In a civic community, we may not learn what is on each others' hearts, but we learn that if we do not hang together, we will hang separately" (Palmer 92). This model is a good one for professors to set as a goal for the whole service-learning class to achieve, realizing that some students will not get to this level and some may go beyond it. While students often do not form intimate connections with clients and staff at their agency under this model, the civic model of community allows students to make substantial connections between the agency, clients, and course materials. For example, if students are given readings on the welfare system and then serve at a site where many of the clients are on welfare, the students can see how the laws impact individuals with whom they have come into contact. Students bring what they observe back to their classroom via writing assignments and/or class discussion and gain a better understanding of the course readings by further exploring and discussing the issue of welfare. Under the civic model, students can determine who matters and who is marginalized and attempt to give a voice to those who are marginalized through sharing the stories of these individuals in students' writing assignments. As students begin to understand the

complexities of the welfare system, the civic model encourages students to move towards participating in social action for the betterment of the agency and the "communities" that surround it by applying what Linda Flower calls "problem solving strategies" which aim, through social action, to address the issue at hand (in this example, welfare reform) at the service-site level and perhaps beyond.

- **Therapeutic Model:** This model "is the model most often implied when we use the word *community* This model makes intimacy the highest value in human relationships, because intimacy is regarded as the best therapy for the pain of disconnection" (Palmer 90, his emphasis). The Therapeutic Model is the ideal one where intimate connections between the student-client and/or student-agency occurs. However, this model takes more time to develop than the other two. Generally, students cannot achieve this level of community at their service-learning site until extensive work with the agency and/or clients has occurred. For many students, it may take more than one semester to achieve this level of community; however, the therapeutic model of community may be seen during the course of the semester from those who have had previous ties to the agencies and/or clients before the service-learning course began. This level of community is more likely to occur after the service-learning requirement is completed if the student chooses to continue with his/her contacts at the agency as a volunteer and/or the student continues to see client(s) outside of the agency after the initial service-learning course (e.g. continuing to mentor an at-risk youth after doing service-learning work at a tutoring facility but not continuing as a tutor at the facility).

- **Community of Truth:** Palmer offers an alternative, albeit idealistic, community which takes the best characteristics from his marketing, civic, and therapeutic models. Palmer finds this model "advances our knowledge through conflict not competition" (103). Palmer sees "competition as the antithesis of community, an acid that can dissolve the fabric of relationships" (103). My study shows that in a service-learning composition course this model is a difficult one for students to reach. Time is better spent examining the other three models to assist student in their service-learning projects.

Works Cited

Adler-Kassner, *et al.*, eds. *Writing the Community: Concepts and Models for Service-Learning in Composition.* Washington, DC: AAHE/NCTE, 1997.

Deans, Thomas. *Writing Partnerships: Service-Learning in Composition.* Urbana: IL: NCTE, 2000.

Flower, Linda. *Problem-Solving Strategies for Writing in College and Community.* Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace, 1998.

Gorelick, Risa P. *The Idea of Community: Service-Learning Connections to the Writing Classroom.* Diss. U of Louisiana at Lafayette, 2001. Ann Arbor: UMI, 2002. 3029834.

Palmer, Parker J. *The Courage to Teach: Exploring the Inner Landscape of a Teacher's Life.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1998.

Palmer's Marketing Model of Community:

- Based on Total Quality Management.
- The basic level of community.
- It attempts to empower both the student and the client with whom s/he works by having the student attempt to "fix" the client's problem(s).
- Biggest flaw: often the student does not have a solid enough understanding of the client and/or the problem in order to correct it.
- This level of community should be carefully monitored to ensure that students have a sufficient understanding of the issues at hand prior to empowering the student to attempt to "fix" any problems.
- Without knowing such background information, the student is not likely to move beyond the Marketing Model of Community during her service at the agency.

Palmer's Civic Model of Community:

- "People who do not and cannot experience intimacy with each other nonetheless learn to share a common territory and common resources, to resolve mutual conflicts and mutual problems. In a civic community, we may not learn what is on each others' hearts, but we learn that if we do not hang together, we will hang separately" (Palmer 92).

- This model is a good one for professors to set as a goal for the whole service-learning class to achieve, realizing that some students will not get to this level and some may go beyond it.

- The civic model encourages students to move towards participating in social action for the betterment of the agency and the "communities" that surround it by applying what Linda Flower calls "problem solving strategies" which aim, through social action, to address the issue at hand at the service-site level and perhaps beyond.

Palmer's Therapeutic Model of Community:

- **This model "is the model most often implied when we use the word *community* This model makes intimacy the highest value in human relationships, because intimacy is regarded as the best therapy for the pain of disconnection" (Palmer 90, his emphasis).**

- **The Therapeutic Model is the ideal one where intimate connections between the student-client and/or student-agency occurs.**

- **This model takes more time to develop than the other two. Generally, students cannot achieve this level of community at their service-learning site until extensive work with the agency and/or clients has occurred. For many students, it may take more than one semester to achieve this level of community.**